

STAFF REPORT

DATE **January 15, 2019**
PLACE **MICHAEL B COLEMAN GOVERNMENT CENTER**
TIME **111 NORTH FRONT STREET, ROOM 205**
3:00 PM

A CALL TO ORDER

B APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MEETING SUMMARY – December 18, 2018

~3:00

MEETING SUMMARY – January 8, 2019 (Business Meeting)

C NEW BUSINESS - APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

- ~3:05** 1. APPLICATION: **EF_19-01-001**
ADDRESS: **500 W BROAD ST**
PROPERTY OWNER: **THE GRAVITY PROJECT LLC**
APPLICANT: **KAUFMAN DEVELOPMENT**
TO BE REVIEWED: **WAYFINDING PACKAGE**

Sub-Districts: **West Broad St** **Arts and Innovation** **Dodge Park**
Code Reference: **3323.21 – EF Development Standards**
3375 - Graphics

Staff Observations:

The applicant is proposing install wayfinding signs throughout the Gravity I site. The application was previously approved at the November 2018 EFRB Regular Meeting without “Mural #1”. The previous approval included a ground sign, directional signage for pedestrians, low-height walls to display the graphics and parking garage branding.

The applicant is returning to request approval for updates to Mural #1 and Mural #2 (as listed in the package). Mural #1 includes tenant signage and a placeholder for artwork with no commercial copy.

The proposal is consistent with the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan and the Graphic Design Guidelines. Staff recommends approval.

Staff Recommendation: **Approval** **Approval with Conditions** **Table** **Disapproval**

D OLD BUSINESS - APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL**~3:15**

3. APPLICATION: EF_18-07-001
ADDRESS: 442 W RICH ST
PROPERTY OWNER: LANCE ROBBINS
APPLICANT: CHRIS SHERMAN
TO BE REVIEWED: COFFEE SHOP EXTERIOR MATERIALS, LANDSCAPING, AND SIGNAGE

Sub-Districts: West Broad St **Arts and Innovation** Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.21 DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS
3375 - Graphics

Staff Observations:

The applicant came before the EFRB in July 2018 to request approval for adaptive reuse of an existing residential structure for a coffee house, located on 442 W. Rich St. in the Arts and Innovation sub-district. The application was approved with conditions to return for final approval of the exterior materials, landscaping, and signage. The approval included a parking modification of 12 to 0 parking spaces.

The updated application includes a request to reduce parking from 14 to 0 spaces (previous parking calculation was incorrect) a site plan, building plans and materials, building elevations, and graphics.

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Art and Innovation District	Staff Comments
Lighting	3323.21	Consistent
Graphics	3323.21	Consistent
Parking	14 parking spaces 2 bicycle parking spaces	0 parking spaces 2 bicycle parking spaces

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
Architecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	
<ul style="list-style-type: none">Historic and other contributing buildings should be preserved to the extent possible and if necessary, incorporated into new development.	Consistent
Landscaping	
<ul style="list-style-type: none">Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits.	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none">Public, semi-public/private, and private spaces should be demarcated clearly through the use of landscape, walls, fences, gates, pavement treatment, signs, and other methods to denote boundaries and/or buffers.	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none">Landscape adjacent to natural features should be used to soften the visual appearance of a development and provide a natural transition between the development and open space areas.	Consistent
Street Trees and Streetscape	
<ul style="list-style-type: none">Tree-lined residential and commercial streets should be either established or maintained.	Consistent

Applicable Graphic Design Guidelines:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
General Guidelines	
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• A wide range of design styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary design and materials.	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Signs that reinforce the creativity, craftsmanship, and industrial character of the East Franklinton District are encouraged.	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Signage should be pedestrian in orientation and scale. Wall and blade signs are preferred. Auto-oriented signage is not appropriate for this district.	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• New signage should be designed to be a logical and complementary component of the overall design of a storefront and/or the associated building's architecture.	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The signage message should be designed in a simple fashion and may include the business name, logo, function and/or street number or address and related artistic treatments.	Consistent
Wall Signs - Storefront	
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Storefront wall signs should not exceed 25 square feet in area. Storefront wall signs should be located within the signage band between the first and second floor windows. Where windows do not exist, the nearest building or buildings in the same block should be used for determining window heights. Regardless, the top of wall signs should not exceed a height of 20 feet measured from grade. Storefront wall sign height should not exceed 60 percent of the total height of the sign band.	Consistent

The proposal is consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan and applicable Code Development Standards and Graphic Design Standards. Staff recommends approval.

If approved, the Board will grant the following modifications to the East Franklinton District Development Standards:

1. To permit a parking reduction from 14 spaces to 0 spaces

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

~3:30 4. APPLICATION: EF_18-06-001
 ADDRESS: 435 W TOWN ST
 PROPERTY OWNER: MANHATTAN PROJECT LLC
 APPLICANT: CHRIS SHERMAN
 TO BE REVIEWED: EVENT CENTER

Sub-Districts: West Broad St **Arts and Innovation** Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.21 DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS

Staff Observations:

435 West Town Street is an existing building within the Arts and Innovation sub district. The building was constructed in two phases, the first addition was built in 1921 and faces Town Street and the second addition was constructed in 1931 to the south of the original structure. B&T Metals first occupied the building in 1942, and in 1943 produced uranium rods as a part of the top secret Manhattan Project.

At the May 17, 2016 EFRB meeting, the Board approved the demolition of the southern portion (1931 addition) of the building with the agreement that the applicant will stabilize and preserve the northern part of the building (1921 addition) fronting Town Street and the condition a marker or display is provided on site to describe the history of the building.

At the July 2018 EFRB meeting, the Board approved the use and development standard modifications, including a parking reduction from 227 parking spaces to 82 parking spaces.

The applicant is now requesting full approval, including building elevations and materials, site plan and landscaping. Graphics will be reviewed as a future application.

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Architecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	
Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton.	Staff recommends mural on the east elevation, removing CMU on the west elevation, and using a metal panel or alternate material over stucco and CMU for the addition and patio
Historic and other contributing buildings should be preserved to the extent possible and if necessary, incorporated into new development.	Consistent
All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building ("foursided" architecture).	Staff recommends mural on the east elevation, removing CMU on the west elevation, and using a metal panel or alternate material over stucco and CMU for the addition and patio. Staff recommends centering OHD on south elevation.
Street-level facades are recommended to be as transparent as possible to create an attractive pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces on ground floors.	Consistent, staff recommends the front entry door be centered on the opening and to match existing windows on either side of the door. Storefront glass is not appropriate.
Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits.	Staff recommends landscaping to buffer the patio from the parking lot in lieu of a CMU wall. Landscaping could include potted shrubs or tall grasses.
Street trees are recommended on all public and private streets, with species and spacing approved by the City of Columbus forester.	Staff recommends street trees on McDowell to be planted at a spacing approved by the City Forester. (In addition to the parking lot trees along McDowell)

Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane.	Staff recognizes that wall sconces provide a small amount of upward directed light. If the applicant can demonstrate the lighting levels will not extend past the height of the building, the lighting may be acceptable.
Ground-mounted or other upward directional lighting should be permissible only where some form of shield or light baffling is provided to create a soft, uniform light quality and minimize light spillage beyond trees, landscaping, walls or signs being illuminated.	Staff recognizes that wall sconces provide a small amount of upward directed light. If the applicant can demonstrate the lighting levels will not extend past the height of the building, the lighting may be acceptable.

The proposal is generally consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. Staff recommends the following changes relative to building materials and site design to provide additional consistency with plan recommendations:

1. Providing street trees in the right-of-way along McDowell Street where none currently exist in addition to the parking lot trees shown along McDowell in response to the plan's recommendation for street trees.
2. Reduce the number of parking spaces in the McDowell lot by 3 in order to provide a 5' setback from the existing building per code standards (79 total spaces)
3. Provide a mural on the east elevation to cover the proposed CMU, not to extend past the CMU.
4. Remove CMU on the west elevation, and extend the window to match the length of the other existing window openings. Brick under the window.
5. Use metal panel or an alternate material to fill in openings around proposed Overhead Garage Doors, and center the OHD in openings.
6. Use metal railing or metal panel as patio boundary instead of CMU and provide additional screening of parking lot with landscaping materials.
7. Provide flat, industrial design, canopy over rear entrance instead of awning.
8. Center the front entry door and match existing windows on either side of the door. Storefront glass is not appropriate on Town Street elevation.

Staff requests additional information about the following items:

9. Location of bicycle parking is not ideal. Are there alternative locations?
10. Detail of guardrail proposed on south elevation of McDowell parking lot
11. Explanation of where curbs exist/do not exist on McDowell lot

Staff recommends to Table the application to provide the applicant additional time to revise the proposal after discussion with Board, or a conditional approval with the above items listed as staff approvable items. Additionally, the applicant should commit to installing a historic sign or plaque with the renovation of the structure.

If approved, the Board will grant the following modifications to the East Franklinton District Development Standards:

12. To permit a parking reduction from 227 spaces to 79 spaces (148 spaces)
13. To allow parking located on McDowell, Rich and Lucas streets as an accessory use to the approved uses within 201 S. Lucas (Phase I), 431 W Town (Phase II), 401 W Town and 400 W Rich as shown on the previously approved site plan (EF_17-01-001) and the approved uses within 435 W Town (EF_18-06-001). (Total number of spaces is 260)

Previously approved modifications to the East Franklinton District Development Standards include:

14. To permit a parking reduction of 145 spaces (from 227 to 82)
15. To reduce the parking setback from 5' to 0'
16. To permit a parking lot (accessory use) to be located on a separate parcel

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

~3:50

2. APPLICATION: EF_18-12-003
 ADDRESS: 79, 83-85 MCDOWELL ST
 PROPERTY OWNER: CITY OF COLUMBUS
 APPLICANT: COLUMBUS HOUSING PARTNERSHIP, INC (HOMEPORT)
 TO BE REVIEWED: DEMOLITION
 NEW CONSTRUCTION

Sub-Districts:	West Broad St	Arts and Innovation	Dodge Park
	3323.19 – Land Use		
	3323.21 – EF Development Standards		
Code Reference:	3321 – General Site Development Standards		
	3312 – Off-Street Parking and Loading		

Staff Observations:

The Columbus Housing Partnership (Homeport) is proposing to construct a four-story, multi-family development at the corner of State and McDowell within the West Broad Street sub district. The units will be intended for families earning 80% AMI or below, and the project is anticipated to be submitted to OHFA as a 2019 tax credit application. The development includes a mix of one, two and three-bedroom units, for a total of 50 units, and a total of 64 parking spaces – 4 onsite spaces and 60 spaces in the Gravity II parking garage. The project is being developed in conjunction with the approved Gravity II development and will utilize parking and site amenities provided for the larger development.

The site is currently owned by the City of Columbus Land Redevelopment Division (Land Bank) and is occupied by a historic church structure. The church was built in 1911 and has been vacant for approximately seven years.

The application is requesting a conditional approval of the following items:

1. Demolition of the existing church
2. Use (> 4 units multi-family)
3. Development Standards

Demolition Permit Review:

Standard	Staff Comments
Replacement use reviewed and approved by EFRB	Applicant is proposing a 4 story, multi-family development with 50 units.
Is the property eligible for Columbus or National Registers of Historic Places?	Yes, the structure is of historic significance.

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Standard	West Broad Sub-District	Staff Comments
4 + dwelling unit building	Permitted Use	Consistent

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Broad Street District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	Consistent
Maximum Front Yard	10' (Except public/private zone)	
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	3'
Minimum Side Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	Consistent
Minimum Rear Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	Consistent

Maximum Bldg Height	5 stories or 60'	Consistent
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public street	Consistent
Lighting	3323.21	TBD
Graphics	3323.21	TBD
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way	Consistent
Parking	52 units * 1.5 spaces = 78	64 spaces provided - 4 onsite and 60 shared spaces (Gravity II) 14 Space Reduction
Bicycle Parking	6 spaces required	6

Overall, the proposal is consistent with the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan.

Staff supports the request for demolition of a historically significant structure based on the following factors: 1. the existing condition of the structure and significant cost burden for restoration; 2. the use of the site to provide affordable housing in the East Franklinton District; 3. A design that is appropriate for the site; 4. A condition of approval for the demolition that there is an award of public financing through tax credits or other financing for the project; 5. A condition of approval to document the historic structure using a cultural resource management consultant – to be coordinated with Historic Preservation Office.

Staff supports the overall proposal, including the request to reduce the number of on-site parking spaces to 4 and to allow a shared parking arrangement with the Gravity II project for an additional 60 spaces.

Staff recommends two motions for the application.

If approved, the Board will grant the following modifications to the East Franklinton District Development Standards:

1. To reduce the minimum parking setback from 5' to 3'
2. To reduce the required number of on-site parking spaces from 78 to 4

Staff Recommendation:
Motion to Approve the Demolition of the Existing Church with the following conditions:

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

1. Tax credits or other public financing is awarded to project for the construction of multi-family housing to provide affordable housing
2. Documentation of the existing structure to be coordinated with the Historic Preservation Office

Staff Recommendation:
Motion to Approve the proposed multi-family development with the following conditions:

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

1. Board review and approval of elevations, materials, landscaping, lighting
2. To provide 60 parking spaces through a shared parking arrangement

E OTHER BUSINESS

- ~4:20**
1. ELECTION OF CHAIR
 2. ELECTION OF VICE-CHAIR

F BOARD APPROVED APPLICATIONS ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

		APPROVED : ITEMS APPROVED	COA ISSUED
1.	EF_18-11-003 500 W BROAD	12/14/2018: WAYFINDING	11/20/2018
2.	EF_18-12-005 40 N GRUBB	12/31/2018: WINDOW REPLACEMENT	12/18/2018

G NEXT MEETING

**TUESDAY – FEBRUARY 19, 2019 AT 3:00 PM
MICHAEL B COLEMAN GOVERNMENT CENTER
111 NORTH FRONT STREET, ROOM 203**